

A COMMERCIAL ROOFING RESOURCE

COMMERCIAL ROOFING VENDOR EVALUATION SCORECARD.

A weighted scoring matrix for comparing commercial roofing contractors apples-to-apples. Built for property managers, facility directors, and ownership committees making high-stakes vendor decisions.



6 WEIGHTED CATEGORIES • 28 SCORED CRITERIA • COMPARE UP TO 4 CONTRACTORS

A TOOL FOR YOUR COMMITTEE

Most contractor selection decisions come down to price and whoever made the best impression in the meeting. This scorecard exists to change that. When your team evaluates roofing contractors against the same criteria at the same weight, price stops being the default tiebreaker and capability becomes the actual conversation.

This tool is designed to be handed to a committee. Each evaluator scores independently, then scores are compared. Gaps between evaluators are usually more valuable than the final number, they surface assumptions worth talking through before you sign anything.

STEP 1	<p>SCORE</p> <p>Rate each contractor on a 1 to 5 scale for every criterion. 1 = Does not meet standard. 3 = Meets standard. 5 = Exceeds standard. Leave blank if you cannot verify.</p>
STEP 2	<p>WEIGHT</p> <p>Each section carries a pre-assigned weight reflecting its relative importance in a commercial vendor decision. Credentials & Compliance: 20%. Service Infrastructure: 25%. Commercial Experience: 20%. Documentation & Reporting: 15%. Scope of Service: 15%. Communication & Process: 5%.</p>
STEP 3	<p>CALCULATE</p> <p>Multiply each section's average score by its weight percentage. Sum the results for a total weighted score out of 5.0. A score below 3.0 in any single section should be treated as a disqualifying flag regardless of overall total.</p>
STEP 4	<p>DOCUMENT</p> <p>Use the Notes column to record where each score came from; a reference call, a certificate on file, a proposal review. Documentation protects your team professionally if the selection is questioned later.</p>
STEP 5	<p>COMPARE</p> <p>Run the same scorecard across all contractors under consideration. The winner isn't always the highest score, it's the contractor whose score you can defend.</p>

1 - Poor	2 - Below Standard	3 - Meets Standard	4 - Above Standard	5 - Exceeds Standard
----------	--------------------	--------------------	--------------------	----------------------

A score of 3.0 or below in Service Infrastructure (Section 2) or Credentials & Compliance (Section 1) should be treated as a disqualifying threshold regardless of total score. These categories represent non-negotiable operational and liability requirements.

CONTRACTOR EVALUATION MATRIX

Score each contractor 1–5 per criterion. Record your verification source in the Notes column. Calculate section subtotals by averaging scores within each section, then multiply by the section weight.

#	Evaluation Criterion	Contractor A 1-5 Score	Contractor B 1-5 Score	Contractor C 1-5 Score	Contractor D 1-5 Score	Notes / Verification Source
---	----------------------	---------------------------	---------------------------	---------------------------	---------------------------	-----------------------------

SECTION 1 | Credentials & Compliance Weight: 20%

1	STATE LICENSING Holds valid Colorado and/or Wyoming contractor license. Verifiable through state licensing board.					
2	INSURANCE COVERAGE General liability (min. \$1M per occurrence), workers' comp, and umbrella policy on file. COI provided upfront.					
3	SAFETY CERTIFICATIONS OSHA compliance, documented safety program, safety record available on request.					
4	PREQUALIFICATION NETWORKS Active in Avetta, ISN, or equivalent third-party contractor vetting platforms.					
5	MANUFACTURER CERTIFICATIONS Certified by at least one major manufacturer (GAF, CertainTeed, Gaco, etc.). Certification level documented.					
Section 1 Subtotal (max 20 weighted pts)						

SECTION 2 | Service Infrastructure Weight: 25%

6	<p>IN-HOUSE SERVICE TEAM Has dedicated, full-time service technicians; not subcontractors. Verify team size and tenure.</p>					
7	<p>24/7 EMERGENCY DISPATCH Confirmed same-day response capability for active leaks. After-hours dispatch available.</p>					
8	<p>RESPONSE TIME COMMITMENT Documented SLA or stated average response time for emergency calls. Ask for examples.</p>					
9	<p>DEDICATED VS. SHARED TEAM Service technicians are separate from installation crews; not pulled from project sites to handle service calls.</p>					
10	<p>SERVICE COVERAGE AREA Covers all properties in your portfolio without subcontracting out-of-area work.</p>					
Section 2 Subtotal (max 25 weighted pts)						

SECTION 3 | Commercial Experience & Track Record – Weight: 20%

11	<p>YEARS IN COMMERCIAL ROOFING Years of experience specifically in commercial work, not residential crossover. Ask for commercial-only reference list.</p>					
12	<p>SYSTEM TYPE QUALIFICATIONS Demonstrated experience with your specific system types: TPO, PVC, EPDM, modified bitumen, metal, coatings.</p>					

13	<p>SIMILAR PROPERTY EXPERIENCE</p> <p>Portfolio includes comparable property types (office, retail, industrial, multi-family) at comparable scale.</p>					
14	<p>REGIONAL EXPERIENCE</p> <p>Familiar with Front Range/Wyoming weather patterns, local code requirements, and permitting process.</p>					
15	<p>VERIFIABLE REFERENCES</p> <p>Provides commercial property manager references willing to take a call, not just project names on a list.</p>					
Section 3 Subtotal (max 20 weighted pts)						

SECTION 4 | Documentation & Reporting Weight: 15%

16	<p>PHOTO-DOCUMENTED CLOSE-OUTS</p> <p>Every service visit and repair produces before/after photos, scope performed, and materials used, delivered without asking.</p>					
17	<p>CONDITION REPORTS</p> <p>Inspection reports include prioritized findings, photos, and clear recommendations, not just a summary paragraph.</p>					
18	<p>WARRANTY COMPLIANCE TRACKING</p> <p>Maintains inspection records and service documentation in a format that satisfies manufacturer warranty requirements.</p>					
19	<p>WARRANTY COMPLIANCE TRACKING</p> <p>Provides lifecycle projections and capital forecasting to support budget planning, not just reactive scopes.</p>					

20	<p>SERVICE HISTORY RETENTION</p> <p>Keeps institutional memory across technicians, prior inspection data is accessible to whoever responds next.</p>					
Section 4 Subtotal (max 15 weighted pts)						

SECTION 5 Scope of Service Weight: 15%						
21	<p>FULL LIFECYCLE COVERAGE</p> <p>Handles maintenance, emergency response, restoration, and replacement under one service relationship.</p>					
22	<p>PREVENTATIVE MAINTENANCE</p> <p>Offers structured, scheduled maintenance plans – not just inspection when called.</p>					
23	<p>RESTORATION CAPABILITY</p> <p>Can perform roof coatings, re-covers, and targeted membrane restoration, not just full replacement.</p>					
24	<p>MULTI-PROPERTY MANAGEMENT</p> <p>Has infrastructure to manage multiple facilities with consolidated reporting and route scheduling.</p>					
25	<p>SINGLE-SOURCE ACCOUNTABILITY</p> <p>One point of contact for all services, no handing off between departments or subcontractors mid-project.</p>					
Section 5 Subtotal (max 25 weighted pts)						

SECTION 6 | Communication & Process Weight: 5%

26	RESPONSIVENESS TO INQUIRY Time from initial contact to proposal, site walk confirmation, and first response to questions.					
27	CLARITY OF SCOPE & PRICING Proposals are line-itemized with clear inclusions and exclusions, no vague deliverables or hidden add-ons.					
28	DESIGNATED POINT OF CONTACT Named account contact for ongoing service relationship, not a general inbox or call center.					
Section 6 Subtotal (max 5 weighted pts)						

#	Evaluation Criterion	Contractor A 1-5 Score	Contractor B 1-5 Score	Contractor C 1-5 Score	Contractor D 1-5 Score	Notes / Verification Source
TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORE						

This scorecard was developed by Roof Source as a resource for commercial property managers and facility teams evaluating roofing contractors. It is intended as a decision-support tool, not a guarantee of contractor performance. Roof Source serves commercial and residential properties across Colorado and Wyoming.